

TO IOM REGIONAL OFFICE FOR THE BALTIC AND NORDIC STATES

**'INTEGRATION THROUGH TRAINING'
A JOINT IOM/OSCE PROJECT FOR NON-ESTONIAN AND
ESTONIAN WOMEN**

INDEPENDENT EVALUATION REPORT

NOVEMBER 2000

Evaluator-Consultant: PhD Klara Hallik,
Senior Fellow, Institute of International and Social Studies, Tallinn Pedagogical University,
7 Estonia Boulevard, Tallinn 10143.
Tel: (372) 6444436
E-mail: hallik@iiss.ee

In co-operation with Ene Hion,
134 Vabaduse Boulevard, Tallinn
Tel: (372) 677 86 35
E-mail: enehion@online.ee

TABLE OF CONTENT

1. Executive summary	2
2. Evaluation scope and methodology.....	3
3. Evaluation of the Project context and its relevance for the target group....	4
3.1. Was the choice of the target group relevant?.....	5
3.2. Assessment of the logic and coherence of the Project.....	7
4. Assessment of the impact of the Project on target group and Estonian community	
4.1. Some general comments	8
4.2. Participants views	9
5. Evaluation of efficiency of the Project	10
5.1. Estonian language exam results	11
5.2. Small business grants.....	12
6. Conclusions	12
7. Annex 1. Terms of reference	13
8. Annex 2. Sources and list of persons interviewed	16
9. Annex 3. Questions posed to those interviewed	17
10. Annex 4. Texts of dept-in interviews	20

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The IOM/OSCE joint project *Integration Through Training* was initiated to continue the activities started by IOM/OSCE project of the same character in 1998. Duration of the current project: 15 December 1999 – 31 October 2000. Total budget: 159 000 USD.

The aim of the Project was to contribute to the integration of the vulnerable group of non-Estonian women and their children into Estonian society. The target group represents the part of the Russophone population whose personal resources for coping with social and political change are rather limited. As a result of economic and political reforms, these people have lost their jobs they were qualified for, and their social status has declined remarkably.

The Project was carried out in the time of launching of the Estonian State Integration Programme (2000-2007), when the practical experience of carrying out integration projects was gained. The experience of the IOM/OSCE Project is unique due to its complex character. The Project combined the target group's language training with social adaptation, civic education and social support for the families of the target group. Project provided Estonian language training for 166 socially vulnerable non-Estonian women via language courses, and for 200 children in the form of summer language camps. It's aim was also to contribute to social and culture awareness of both Russian and Estonian women, and to encourage them to undertake joint activities for building up sense of mutual understanding and respect towards culture differences in Estonian society. Project's particular aim was to assist the target group's members become aware on their employment rights, and to start their own small business.

The aim of the current evaluation is to assess the completion and performance of the Project and compare the results with the project objectives and purposes. It is also supposed to assess the results the target group has achieved while participating in the Project.

Based on the gathered information and acquired knowledge, the evaluators rate the project positive in all its aspects: language training, civic training, and also in the wider social effect the project had. The Project provided the following benefits:

- the language skills of the participants have improved, 70 per cent of those who sit for an examination, passed it successfully;
- participants got a new experience in communicating with public authorities and Estonian voluntary organisations, and skills how to represent and defend one's interests;
- participants, both Estonians and Russians had an opportunity to learn more closely about lifestyle of each other; Project contributed a lot to better understanding of a common good of Estonian people, and of similar social problems of women of different ethnic and cultural background.

2. Evaluation scope and methodology

The evaluation was conducted by PhD Klara Hallik, independent consultant, and in accordance with signed agreement, and requirements settled in the terms of reference (Annex 1). Evaluation was carried out from July to October, 2000.

The evaluation included a review of the relevant documents, such as Interim report (June 2000), self-evaluation of the Project (January 2000), monthly reports of language teachers, programs of seminars, budget proposals.

The impact of the project is evaluated through discussions and interviews with the members of the target group as well as with the responsible organisers and teachers. The evaluators have participated in the following events – language camp for the children of Sillamäe and Narva project participants, Narva and Narva-Jõesuu women's language learning days in Estonian families and children's language camp in Hiiumaa as well as two project seminars, one on small business management, and another devoted to women's role in European integration.

Evaluators have paid special attention to the opinions of the beneficiaries, for which 2 semi-structured interviews and 20 dept-in interviews were carried out (found in Annex 4). Altogether 112 project participants were interviewed (Annex 3) Also Ms Tina Ilsen, as the originator of the Project, and Ms Tatyana Sinyova from the Office of Representative of OSCE in Tallinn, as responsible person for Project management from OSCE side, have been interviewed. I have to admit that both of mentioned persons have taken their mission very seriously and with a great conscious of responsibility.

The main questions in formal and informal interviews focused on the following issues: How effective is the language training? How has project participation helped the women to find a job or secure the one already found? How conducive has the project been in terms of learning more about life in Estonia? How much has project participation helped women to get organised and has it contributed to co-operation and the establishment of mutual support networks? What are the recommendations for the future?

3. Evaluation of the project context and its relevance for the target group

The overall objective of the project was to contribute to integration in the multicultural society of Estonia, through language and culture-related training, strengthening co-operation of the women of different ethnic background, and by providing civic education related training and basic knowledge on business management. The target group of the project consisted of particularly vulnerable non-Estonian women - single mothers, divorcees and widows.

3.1. Was the choice of the target group relevant?

Today's multiethnic society of Estonia is characterised by high level of ethnic segmentation and separation of Estonian and Russian-speaking communities. This is the result of the top-down official migration policy that took place during the Soviet rule. The ethnic division of the Estonian society is cumulative in character – the language barrier is consistent with:

- (a) the ethnic segmentation in residence patterns (80 per cent of non-Estonians live in cities, where they form the linguistic majority, which is up to 96-98 per cent of the inhabitants of Narva and Sillamäe);
- (b) engagement in industry, agriculture and public services;
- (c) a different legal status of the population groups living in Estonia (ethnic Estonians consist 65 per cent of the population, but 83 per cent of the Estonian citizenry; half of the non-Estonians are stateless, i.e. have no citizenship at all).

Half of the non-Estonians are first-generation immigrants, who have been mostly educated outside Estonia. Until recently, the social, family and cultural ways of Ida-Virumaa region belonged more to the Leningrad (i.e. Russian) than to Estonian zone of influence.

3.1.1. Given that information, the choice of the target group from Ida-Virumaa and the satellite towns of Tallinn can be said to have been very relevant. The involvement of women from the former Soviet military settlements in Harjumaa county is relevant, as because of their family ties, a large share of educated Russian women worked in closed semi-military establishment, largely cut off from developments in Estonia.

3.1.2. Estonian State Integration Programme (2000-2007) is language-centred, as only 25-30 per cent of non-Estonians have sufficient Estonian language skills needed to manage their jobs and daily life in Estonia. The aim of the Integration Programme is to make the Estonian the *lingua franca* of the Estonian society, and not only the 'official language'.

Insufficient Estonian language skills are the main reason behind slow elimination of statelessness in Estonia. According to sociological studies, at least 70 per cent of the non-citizens, who'd like to apply for Estonian citizenship, are not able to acquire the Estonian language skills necessary for naturalisation without systematic language training.

According to the 1999 amendments to the Estonian Language Act, the current Estonian language skill certificates are invalid as of 2002. Since 1992, 111 000 certificates have been given to people who have passed the language examinations. Compared to the previous language requirements, the new work related language proficiency requirements are a lot more demanding and in many cases, people with Estonian language proficiency certificates would need further training.

The Project's emphasis on language training corresponds to the requirements of the state language policy and integration strategy. It is also highly relevant from the point of view of the non-Estonians themselves. For more than half of the participants in the Project, this was their first ever Estonian language instruction, others had had some contact with the Estonian language before. The citizenship of the participants corresponds more or less to the make-up of the overall citizenship of the non-Estonians in Estonian society. Thus 25 per cent of the participants were Estonian citizens (national average 29-30 per cent), 21 per cent were citizens of the Russian Federation or other countries (national average 17-19 per cent), and 53 per cent of the participants have no citizenship.

3.1.3. The transformation from state planned economy to liberal market economy drastically changed the situation in the Estonian labour market. During the independence, the share of employed people has fallen by a quarter. The major decline has occurred in industry, which is the main employer of the non-Estonian population, and also in agriculture, which mainly involves Estonians. The decline of these industries led to the decline of the social position of the ethnic groups involved.

Whereas Estonians rather quickly and successfully overcome the new economical situation, it's been more difficult for non-Estonians. According to many analysts, the social cost of the socio-economic reforms of Estonia has been too high. Beside other indicators of social polarisation, one can also notice the increase of social inequalities between ethnic groups. The citizenship and Estonian language skills play a significant role in ethnic and social stratification.

An increasing competition for employment, which requires both functional skills and the knowledge of official language (i.e. Estonian), means that the Russophone job-seekers face more difficulties than Estonians. According to a sociological survey carried out in 1997, 15 per cent of non-Estonians have lost their job because of insufficient Estonian language skills, whereas 17 per cent have faced the threat of losing the job. Altogether 15 per cent have not got the job they applied for, and 23 per cent chose not to apply for the position they were otherwise qualified for – all because of insufficient Estonian language skills (Kruusvall 2000).

3.1.4. Due to objective structural transformation and socio-political change, the main losers in status have been the non-Estonian political elite, and top specialists (decline in numbers during the last 10 years is 32 and 56 per cent, respectively). At the same time, the employment of the 'blue-collar' workers of elementary occupations has increased by 23 per cent. The Russian-speaking employment force has become very 'proletarian' in nature – 66 per cent of them are blue-collar, compared to 51 per cent of Estonians (Estonian Labour Force Survey 1995, 1999).

... on the background of those changes, one can notice that non-Estonian women have fared worse. The collapse of the mass industry, the disappearance of over-staffed offices of the socialist era and support services, and Estonianisation of civil service, have contributed to higher than average unemployment among non-Estonian women. The current situation of the job market has not yet stabilised, and the risk remains high both for Estonians and other ethnic groups. In 1999, the unemployment was 11,7 per cent, being slightly higher among non-Estonians – 16,4 per cent. In year 2000, the numbers are 14,8 and 20 per cent, respectively. In 2000, the unemployment among non-Estonian women was 16,5 per cent, being 20 per cent for non-citizens and 21,4 per cent for women with very limited Estonian language skills.

According to various surveys, the average salary of non-Estonians is lower than that of Estonians - in Tallinn, the average 'non-Estonian salary' is 67 per cent of the average 'Estonian salary' (Pavelson 2000; Estonian Labour Force Survey 1999, 2000).

Overall, the project involved a socially representative group, and targeted that part of the Estonian Russophone population whose social situation worsened due to social transformations, and not because of their personal inability or carelessness. At the start of the project, 44 per cent of the women were unemployed, most income came from social benefit, and income from occasional jobs was rare. Ninety per cent had dependant children – according to various surveys, most single mothers belong to risk groups.

I believe that the project's target group was very relevant for the project's goals and objectives. More important than the money allocated by IOM/OSCE for carrying out the project *per se* (itself the main reason for project's success), I judge highly the reasoned allocation of the support, that contributes to the increased social capital of the participants.

3.2. Assessment of the logic and coherence of the Project

While evaluating the coherence and logic of the project, I judge the accordance of project objectives with expected results and the means taken for that end.

3.2.1. To improve the participants' Estonian language skills and prepare them for the Estonian language exam, the following activities were carried out:

- informing the audience of the language training possibilities
- 52 per cent of the participants learned about the training possibilities through media, 50 per cent heard about it from acquaintances, 13 per cent from the language instructor. One can say, that everybody had a similar chance to compete for participation – very important, considering that over 600 people expressed their interest in participating.
- the language study groups were compiled according to language tests, which contributes to better learning success

3.2.2. The current project has same strategic aims as the Nordic/UK/UNDP project 'Support to the State Integration Programme' – namely, to combine language training with other integration activities, giving the financial capabilities. This differs from the EU/PHARE Estonian Language Training Programme, which concentrates on language instruction only.

The project has planned and organised seminars that introduce NGO and local government activities. The major project events have been organised in locations, where the participants have a chance to learn about Estonian culture and traditions.

The project has aimed, both in setting its objectives and planning its activities, to increase contacts between Estonian and Russian-speaking women, which until now have been minimal outside job contacts.

The project has tried to guarantee that the increase in Estonian language competence would lead to practical improvement in social and economic situation of the women.

Overall, the project's objectives have been complex, and thus led to increase in both the personal wellbeing of the participants, and also contributed to the reasonable public benefit.

4. Assessment of the impact of the project on target group and Estonian community

Various integration projects in Estonian society, mainly through Estonian language instruction, have been funded, and often initiated, since mid-1990s by international organisations and foreign embassies in Estonia. Estonian state has mainly provided for the Estonian language instruction within the national education curriculum, unfortunately with limited success. Therefore the support of various organisations and institutions for Estonian language training is needed and welcome both now and in the future.

4.1. Some general comments.

The joint IOM/OSCE project was very valuable for the following reasons (opinion based on the comments of both Russian and Estonian women that took part at the project).

- It is important, that the Project was long-lasting. Beginning in 1998, it enabled to give more thorough language training, and develop a functioning network of organisers, teachers, and participants. 83 per cent of the Project participants expressed wish to continue participating in the project.
- IOM/OSCE project was very attractive because language instruction, participation at language training camps, and seminars, was free of charge for the participants. Whereas sometimes people do not appreciate enough the goods they receive for free, then in this particular case, the help was appreciated a lot. 83 per cent of the participants believed the financial support to be the main contributor for the success of the Project, 16 per cent believed it to be important. I emphasise here again, that such language training is only provided by some private companies, usually one must pay for these courses, and the costs are increasing.

Language instruction is a sphere, where the resources of the Estonian State and the expectations of the Russian-speaking community are somehow conflicting. According to sociological surveys, altogether 85 per cent of the Russophones believe that the State should finance the language training. 50 per cent of the respondents believe that the local government should pay for it, and 40 per cent would let their employers to provide for language training. Still, half of the respondents believe that the costs related to language training should be paid for by the non-Estonian NGOs, Estonian donors, and the learners themselves (Kruusvall 2000).

As the Project had recognisable financial resources, it was able to hire the best language teachers from Ida-Virumaa. 82 per cent of the participants rated the level of language instruction as 'excellent'. Of those with previous language instruction experience, 60 per cent believed that the current instruction was better than the previous one.

There are various language teaching projects for children, and most popular of those are the summer language camps in Estonian-speaking environment. IOM/OSCE organised those camps free of charge, and thus helped the participating single mums a lot, both morally and financially. As IOM/OSCE has finance such language camps before, the children, who have already participated in such language camps, dream of learning Estonian language in the countryside again.

Trips to historic heritage sites, beautiful nature reserves, museums and exhibitions, and important Estonian towns in the South Estonia, took place during these camps. These

have been very important for children from rather closed Ida-Virumaa region, and give them a better idea of the country and its people, that they share their home with.

Overall, I believe it is safe to say, that at least in Ida-Virumaa and Hiiumaa, the current project has raised the knowledge of the existence of the IOM and increased the prestige of the OSCE among both Estonians and Russians.

4.2. Participant views. Excerpts from the interviews

Opinions of the Russian-speaking participants

The target group regarded very highly the chance to get to know Estonia; to see places that they had not visited before; to meet Estonian people and get to know their lives; to get outside the narrow and limited frames of the Russian-speaking community; and to feel oneself to be part of the Estonian society:

'The problem of my life has been that I have had no roots, I have changed the places I live and homes, schools and friends, started all over again several times. I want my children to know from the very beginning that there is a place in the world which is their homeland and that they have a place where they are always at home. I want to do everything for this to happen.'

Participation at the project helped to regain the self-esteem and gave hope to find a one's place in the transformed society:

'What most amazes me with the project is that all the participants have become stronger, self-confident, and helpful, and we are all full of energy and wish to be active.'

'In a day, I became a widow and a single mother. Our family is not the only one to break up in the political turmoil. /.../ For the support money I bought a good sowing machine and other necessary things, decorated the workshop. Thanks to the language courses I can speak with my clients in both Estonian and Russian. I'm an entrepreneur!'

'I am very keen to learn Estonian, because the more the business grows and the more contacts I have outside my hometown, the more communications there will be in Estonian. I'm active in the Town Council of Narva in solving the problems of disabled persons and I understand that it is much easier for me to manage in public service offices when I'm able to speak the state language. As I attend the IOM/OSCE Estonian language courses, I can teach my daughters at home to speak Estonian. We are Russians by nationality but we want to stay in Estonia, this is where our home is.'

Increased contacts with Estonian society have created interest in one's own ethnic background and national values.

'I had never been to Estonia. And Narva is not a real Estonia. All the life went on in Russian. I managed to meet some Estonians who had stayed in Narva. I was touched by their attitude towards the culture of their nation, their eagerness when they told me about that, their wish to be the patriots of their homeland. As soon as the opportunity came to start learning Estonian, I joined the courses. It was not easy. Refugees have no real home,

no job, no connections, no bright perspective. Thanks to the IOM/OSCE project I could learn Estonian free of charge. I'm grateful for the opportunity. Grateful not only for the language classes. I'm also grateful because as I saw the work that is done in Estonia to make the newcomers realise where they live and what kind of people Estonians are, I started to think more and more about the destiny of my unhappy Belorussia. I'm a Belorussian, a member of a big and talented nation but I don't know the Belorussian language. Believe me or not but I started to study my mother tongue only here, in Estonia. We have a Belorussian society in Narva for our language and culture studies. At present I learn two languages at a time and I feel that my life is richer than ever before, never mind that it is very difficult to cope economically'.

Opinions of the Estonian participants

Direct contact with Russian people and joint activities helps to understand, that difference between nations is not a limiting border, but a basis for fruitful communication and mutual understanding:

'We have become friends. I'm happy that her Estonian has improved so much but I and my family have learned very much from Ljubov. Now I know a great deal more about the life of Russians, their life, their culture, traditions and what's most important – I understand the problems of people who live among other nationality'.

Project's success and acquired skills can be developed further and stimulate Estonians to participate in their implementation.

'Since the first days, I have had the thoughts that such method of teaching and learning a language can also make a good business idea. My husband's parents have a farm in Hiiumaa. We could make the farm into a language study centre to operate not as a tourist farm but as a language centre where people would be able to practice their Estonian in the natural environment for moderate fees and also gain knowledge about Estonians' way of life, cultural background, etc. So the project has given me a good idea for the future.'

Identification with Estonia is multi-faceted and changing. Even without citizenship and with insufficient language skills, most non-Estonians consider Estonia to be their homeland, and they wish to relate the future of themselves and their children with Estonia. 'Belonging to the society' and be part of Estonian life, is of primary importance for them. IOM/OSCE project have definitely contributed for the increase and strengthening of such a feeling of belonging.

5. Assessing the efficiency of the project in increasing the well-being of the target group

While evaluating the efficiency of the project, I take into consideration that some of the outcomes can be measured immediately and directly, others can only be noted later. In longer perspective, the productivity of the project depends on the capabilities, efforts and determination of the participants, as well as on the extent to which the socio-economic environment supports the implementation of the acquired skills.

The two project objectives that can be measured immediately were:

- 1) passing of the Estonian language examination
- 2) implementation of the small business project grants

5.1. Estonian language examination results

The overall passing rate of the Estonian language examinations is satisfactory. So far 120 participants of Project have sit for exam, 70 per cent of them passed it (73 per cent of elementary level, and 68 per cent of intermediate level). According to the National Examination Centre, the average passing rate of the beginners' level examination is 60-70 per cent, 40-50 per cent at the intermediate level and only 30 per cent at the advanced level. As the language examination categories were changed only recently (they are stricter now than before), it is inevitable, that previous amount of language instruction is not sufficient to fulfil the requirements and pass the examination. Sixty per cent of the project participants judged the examination more difficult than they expected.

One criteria for judging the efficiency of the project is the fact that 10 per cent of the participants are willing and capable of continuing language study independently, two-thirds would continue with the help of supervised language instruction.

The project participants judged the increase of the functional Estonian language skills as following:

- 25 per cent – improvement in communication with customers and colleagues
- 22 per cent – improvement of administration skills
- 60 per cent – improvement of reading and writing skills

One participant out of five mentioned surprisingly, that they are able to assist their children with Estonian language homework. This joint parent-child activity is of enormous psychological importance, despite of the Estonian language skills. When the children and parents overcome the language barrier together, the 'disabled parents' syndrome is avoided. The 'disabled parent' syndrome has been evident in cases where children from Russian-speaking homes attend Estonian-medium schools, and their parents, with insufficient Estonian language skills, are unable to judge or check upon their children's progress in school. Apart from language requirements, the Russian-medium schools have a considerable number of curriculum hours dedicated to 'Estica' block, which contains Estonian history, culture and country studies. The Russian-speaking parents, who were educated in Russian-medium schools, have only faint knowledge of the topic. The IOM project carried out several informative seminars on civic education and culture, which helped to decrease the intergenerational gap of knowledge about Estonia.

During the project period, the Estonian Language examination requirements became more difficult, which resulted in a need for more language instruction. Whereas in 1998, the optimal length of a language course was considered to be 120 hours, then in 1999 it was 140 hours. To fulfil the current examination requirements, at least 180 hours for the first degree, and 200 hours for the second degree, instruction is needed. These changes could not have been anticipated by the authors of the Project, and it was not possible to make corrections into the budget while Project was already running. Proposal to increase the funding for language training in March 2000, repeated in May and June, was rejected. Thus 2,5 months of language training was not funded. Teachers did some unpaid work, but participants still didn't receive the necessary amount of instruction. This is proved by

the fact that 24 applicants out of those 34 who did not get a positive result, gathered 54 – 59 points (out of 60 necessary). I have been told that four teachers, at least, are doing further lessons to more advanced students, and they will repeat the test in coming months.

5. 2. Small business grants

Small business project grants fulfilled their objectives very successfully. Incorporating the Tallinn and Ida-Virumaa Employment Office into the management of the start-up capital of the business activities, provided the project participants with professional guidance in drawing up and implementing business plans. This co-operation also guaranteed the purposeful use of the start capital. The follow-up showed, that all 15 grant receivers implemented their business plans in accordance to the small business project grant contract. Today, 12 of the 15 grant receivers, have registered as self-employed with the National Tax Agency. Seven grant receivers from Ida-Virumaa have been especially successful, having registered with the Business Registry. They have abandoned the ranks of the unemployed, and have themselves employed another 8 persons.

There is a reason to believe, that even when not all grant receivers can sustain their business activities for long, they have all acquired important skills and experience for orientating themselves in the business environment.

6. Conclusions

Our main conclusion is that the Project clearly met its stated overall objectives to contribute to integration of non-Estonian women and their children into Estonian society. Project design, activities taken for its implementation, and allocation of funding was in line with the named objectives. IOM/OSCE project was complex in its character, combining language training with several informative seminars on civic education and culture, which helped to decrease the intergenerational gap of knowledge about Estonia, and thus led to increase in both the personal wellbeing of the participants, and also contributed to the reasonable public benefit.

The outcome and results of language training is satisfactory. However, it was not possible to achieve the maximum efficiency because of change of requirements for passing language test, which were made in time when the project was already running.

Project clearly contributed to strengthening the position of vulnerable group of women in Estonia by providing civic education related training and basic knowledge on employment rights and business management. For the most members of target group participation in Project improved their possibilities in coping with social problems, and strengthened their self-esteem.

The Project was conducted in conformity with the Grant application. I cannot go into details in my evaluation of the provided financial support, which, I am convinced, was carried out according to the relevant IOM rules and guidelines. I have acquainted myself with the expenditure summary, and believe it to be in accordance with the project budget and objectives. As I have emphasised earlier, the project was financially very comprehensive and the extent of the financial support enabled fulfilling the complex integration-related objectives of the project.

ANNEX 1 TERMS OF REFERENCE

International Organization for Migration Regional Office for the Baltic and Nordic States

Project Evaluator- Consultant Contract

General

Functions:

In co-operation with the staff of the Regional Office of IOM for the Baltic and Nordic States and the Office of the OSCE Representative in Tallinn, the Project Evaluator will be responsible for conducting the external evaluation of the "Integration through Training - a Joint IOM/OSCE Project for Socially Vulnerable Women" carried out by IOM-Helsinki and OSCE- Tallinn during 1999-2000. Specific duties and responsibilities will include:

1. Assessing the logic and the coherence of the project design and the adequacy of the objectives of the project. The evaluation will also analyse the relevance of the target group benefiting from the project.
2. Assessing the performance and success of IOM and OSCE in the implementation of the project, including the impact on the target population as well as on the Estonian community in facilitating the integration.
3. Analysing the effectiveness of the project in contributing to the well-being of the beneficiaries and assess the change brought about especially with regard to the integration process of the project participants.
4. Elaborating a survey tool, conducting the survey among the project participants and relevant counterparts from Sillamae, Narva, Narva-Joesuu, Kohtlarjarve and Johvi and analysing the results of the survey. The objective of the survey is to draw data which allows the evaluator to answer to the evaluation concerns mentioned in points 2 and 3 of this TOR.
5. Assess the efficiency of the project by analysing the levels of funding of the project versus; its activity level.
6. Evaluating the effectiveness of the Business Grant component of the "Integration through Training a Joint IOM/OSCE Project for Non-Estonian and Estonian Women" carried out in 1998-1999 in reaching its objectives and expected results.
7. Presenting one written progress report on the evaluation. The progress report is due by 30 September 2000. Presenting one written final evaluation report on the implementation of the projects in English. The final report is due by 30 November 2000.
8. Any other activities required for the successful implementation of the evaluation of the projects.

Methodology:

The methodology required for completing the evaluation and compiling the evaluation report includes:

Documentation review

Review and analysis of the project documents, project budget and reports

Existing studies and research literature on the ethnic relations and integration processes in Estonia should be used as a background against which especially the above mentioned evaluation concerns 1. should be evaluated

Survey

Elaborating a survey methodology and conducting a survey which results can be considered to be statistically valid among the project participants living in the project sites mentioned in the point 4

Field visits and interviews

Conduct interviews with members of the project management team and other relevant actors in the project e.g. representatives of the partner NGOs.

Conducting interviews with the relevant authorities responsible for the integration matters in Estonia

Evaluation of the Business grant component of the project will require conducting interviews with Business Grant recipients in living in Amari, Paldiski, Klooga, Sillamae, Narva, Narva-Joesuu, Kohtlarjarve and Johvi and visiting the enterprises established with the co-funding of the Project.

ANNEX 2. SOURCES AND LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED

Eamets, R., Philips, K., Annus, T. (1999) Background Study on Employment and Labour Market in Estonia. Working Document. European Training Foundation. Torino-Tartu

Estonian Labour Force Survey 1995 (1997) Estonian Labour Force at the Beginning of 1995 and General Changes in 1989-1995. Statistical Office of Estonia. Tallinn-Viljandi

Helemäe, J., Saar, E., Vöörmann, R. (2000) Kas haridusse tasus investeerida? Tallinn, TA Kirjastus

Hallik, K. Ethnically Divided Estonia. – Estonian Human Development Report 1999. UNDP Tallinn

Kruusvall, J. (200) Eesti keele õppimine kui sotsiaalne probleem. – Laius, A. et al, toim. Integratsioonimastik – ükskõiksusest koosmeeleni. AEF&Jaan Tõnissoni Instituut, Tallinn.

Interviewed persons

Grant receivers:

Alla Abaševa

Ludmilla Turina

Tatjana Kulikova

Marika Baar – Head of Employment Office, Tallinn

Maie Metsalu – Head of Employment Office, Ida-Virumaa county

Language camp participants and their hosts:

Kersti Vesilind

Tatjana Korotkevitch

Ljubov Nikker

Maire Paljas

Teachers of Estonian:

Vladimir Zubarev

Moonika Laht

Marge Mägi

Kristi Tamme

The examiner of the state language

Participants of the project:

Nadežda Sporõhhina

Valentina Gorbunova

Jevgenija Bobjor

Politicians: Maret Maripuu MP

Katrin Saks Minister

Jelena Ivanova Head of Centre-party organisation in Narva

Field visits:

Language camp in Piilu farm for children from Narva and Sillamäe

Narva and Narva-Joesuu women's language learning days in Estonian families, Hiiumaa

Youth and children language training camp in Hiiumaa

Entrepreneurship seminar for Project participants

EU integration seminar

Estonian language state-exam

ANNEX 3. QUESTIONS POSED TO THOSE INTERVIEWED

(A) for participants in business seminar (48 persons)

Demographic variables

- age
- education
- family
- profession and occupation
- citizenship

Current social position

- employee (character of job)
- employer (self-employed or other)
- other activities

Previous study of Estonian

Assessment of language knowledge

- can manage in everyday communication
- can manage in every situation
- can read
- can write

Necessity of Estonian for communication

- with co-workers
- boss
- officials
- clients

Has participation in Project

- helped to learn more precisely Estonian laws
- to create contacts useful for business
- to learn more about Estonians and women organisations

What is opinion on interethnic relations in Estonia. Are they developing in better or worse direction.

(B) Questions at the end of Project (64 persons interviewed)

Assessment of IOM/OSCE Project

- satisfactory
- good
- excellent

If earlier attended language courses, did the current language training give you

- less than former courses
- more than former courses
- information beyond language

Have you improved your ability for

- communication with clients
- communication with employer
- communication with officials
- reading
- writing

To what extent the examination met your expectation. Was it

- easier than expected
- more complicated

Which of events organised by Project did you attend?

Did participation in the Project helped you

- to get a better paid job or position
- to become sure that can do better
- know how to defend one's interests
- to do better with children

How did you learn about Project

- from media announcement
- from friends/acquaintances
- Estonian teacher

Citizenship status

Is the level language knowledge sufficient to continue study on your own

In case you are planning to continue language training, what is the purpose

- to receive a higher degree
- to improve writing ability
- to improve conversation ability

What is the most important in IOM/OSCE Project

- quality of training
- free of charge
- to become acquainted with Estonian society and people

ANNEX 4. SELECTED TEXTS OF INTERVIEWS

Nadežda Sporõhhina

Nadežda is 40 years old, she has three children and she is an engineer by profession. They live in the town of Sillamäe. Nadežda has studied in the Novosibirsk Electrical Technology Institute and Ilnn Technical University. Both Nadežda and her programmer husband have been unemployed for years.

My problems started after the Soviet secret military factory in Sillamäe was liquidated. The factory in the closed town enriched uranium. Most of the employees had been brought from Russia; every third one had higher education. The salaries were good. The town of Sillamäe that required special permits for entry was as well provided for as the elite regions of Moscow or the space town Zvjozdnõi. We had had no worries. We did not realise that we live in Estonia, which is a land of Estonians who speak their own language, have their own culture and history.

I only realised we are strangers after the military factory was closed down and thousands of Russian speaking employees lost their jobs...

My life has been restless from the very beginning. My father was a Mari, a nation belonging to the Finno-Ugric tribe, my mother was Jewish. I was born in a Soviet officer's family in China. We lived in the building that was formerly owned by the Soviet Embassy. I returned to Russia after finishing secondary school and started studies in the biggest scientific centre of Siberia, in Novosibirsk. My speciality was the construction of nuclear electrical stations. In four years I decided to study automatics and electronics. Back then, one of the best universities in the Soviet Union in these subjects was the Tallinn Technical University. I had married during my studies in the Institute, I already had a little daughter but my husband and I separated. I came to Estonia with my daughter, passed the exams and was enrolled in the Technical University. My child went to a nursery school. Before I graduated from the University, I married a young Russian man from Sillamäe. Since my husband had a flat in Sillamäe, we accepted a job offer in the Sillamäe factory.

Everything changed in 1991. I was about to give birth to my third child when the factory was closed. Fortunately I got a job as an occupational and safety inspector in the Sick Fund. As I was not thrilled about the job, I started to study journalism on the courses that were organised at a Russian weekly newspaper. It was the right choice because I soon had to give up the occupational and safety inspector's job – I did not know the state language and could not communicate with the Estonians who needed assistance.

I started to work for newspapers and TV in Moscow. I leased a camera and made news reports to the news programmes. As my husband and I had decided that our family home is in Estonia, I started to learn Estonian. It has been difficult because there is nobody to speak Estonian to in Sillamäe. I have attended several courses and met many teachers. The IOM/OSCE project is the best – the project has not only given us grammar lessons and translation exercises, it has also given us knowledge about Estonia and its people. For the first time I went out from the closed community of Sillamäe, found friends and acquaintances among Estonians, made new contacts with Russian women living in other towns.

What most amazes me with the project is that all the participants have become stronger, self-confident, and helpful and we are all full of energy and wish to be active.

The problem of my life has been that I have had no roots, I have changed the places I live and homes, schools and friends, started all over again several times. I want my children to know from the very beginning that there is a place in the world which is their homeland and that they have a place where they are always at home. I want to do everything for this to happen.

Interview with the examiner of the state language

The examiner gives us an interview on the condition that his/her name will not be made public.

I have examined hundreds of people who belong to the Russian minority. I'm an Estonian language teacher myself. I know the problems of teaching and learning and can assess the actual language skills of the examinees.

The current state language examinations system is not based on assessing communicative language skills but it tests the skills of taking tests. These skills are different. A person might be able to communicate rather freely in Estonian but the questions asked at the examination are not so much concerned with expressing himself or herself but rather to show how well informed the person is in various subjects and areas. For example, a test may ask for cures of some diseases, possible failures of a car engine, latest news in astronomy research, etc. It is certainly good if a person who wants to work in Estonia in whichever position, can manage to discuss various topics in Estonian. But the people applying for citizenship and operating on a certain field and within the boundaries of certain topics do not have to be universal linguists. I have checked my own and other state language teachers' knowledge by the exam tests. Unfortunately even the teachers don't often know the right answer. The tasks have been made up in the way that in order to pass the exam you have to see through the 'tricks' and 'catches' that try to confuse the examinee.

Of course, my opinion is not quite objective. When I sit at the examiner's desk, I behave in accordance with the regulations and there is no giving in. But I feel how difficult it is to get a positive results. I become nervous just as the examinee and I do everything to keep calm and not to show my attitude towards a failing task. Besides, the level of complexity is not the same in all the exams. Today I was really embarrassed to ask the illogical questions that were sent to be asked with the test.

The most difficult moment is when the person who has passed language courses hands in his examination test and looks quizzically at the examiner – how did I do. I cannot tell him anything.

Examination day is always a stressful day.

Interviews with the grant-winning women:

Alla Abasheva.

Alla is 40years old, she lives in the town of Paldiski that during the Soviet regime was a so-called 'closed town'. Russian nuclear submarine crews were trained in Paldiski, including the captain of the sunken Russian submarine 'Kursk'. Alla is a mother of two – a daughter of 19 and a son of 13.

I'm a Ukrainian, born in the Central Ukraine, in inland, amongst big fields of grain. I married a young Russian marine officer who was sent to Estonia. My husband studied in Paldiski, in the Russian nuclear submarines training centre. I worked as a sales assistant in the military trade association and as a waitress in the local regiment canteen. Paldiski was a military town. Estonians were not allowed to live in the town. The nuclear submarine centre was a top secret object. Entrance to the town was granted by special permits only. The military and their families were living in a state within a state. Even the wives of the military had no idea how dangerous it was. An accident in the reactor of the training centre was a nuclear catastrophe.

I had enough common sense to think of preparing myself for a civilian life and learn a vocation. Besides working, I took up trade studies in Tallinn College. Now I know how important and right this step was.

When Estonia became independent and the Russian army was taken out, my husband left together with the centre of nuclear submarines: it was a good opportunity to separate from wife and children. My husband simply dumped us.

In a day, I became a widow and a single mother. Our family is not the only one to break up in the political turmoil.

In the beginning it was very difficult. The moral blow, lack of money, unemployment... But life went on and the children had to be fed. In order to become a salesperson, according to the Language Law, I had to know the Estonian language. I started the studies on my own.

My salary was not enough to feed three people. Since I had learned sewing at school in the Ukraine, I decided to start making clothes in the evenings.

I set up a workshop at home. The first clients appeared. I make clothes for women who have little money. I do it for little money – adjust second-hand clothes that are not fashionable any more. Women always want to look nice. When the opportunity came to get support for establishing a firm of my own, I applied. And I did get the IOM/OSCE project grant!

For the support money I bought a good sewing machine and other necessary things, decorated the workshop. Thanks to the language courses I can speak with my clients in both Estonian and Russian. I'm an entrepreneur!

I'm planning to expand my firm. As I have also studied accounting, I know how to develop a firm. I feel secure.

I will get Estonian citizenship after I pass the language exam. My daughter speaks Estonian fluently, she already has the "blue passport" (the passport of the citizen of Republic of Estonia). I am not concerned about my children's education. I can afford to give them good education.

Ludmilla Turina

Ludmilla is 43 and she lives in Narva – in Russian-Estonian border town with nearly 95% of Russian population.

Two daughters (22 and 16 years old) are both disabled – because of the poliomyelitis.

I decided to become an entrepreneur for the sake of my children. The children must have the chance to work so they can cope by themselves. My idea was to establish a firm that provides work for disabled persons. This was my objective for applying for grant to start business.

The grant bought a good, computer-equipped sewing machine that also does embroidery according to a given programme. We produce top quality embroidered bedding.

Besides, we make souvenirs of sea stones and seashells. Our souvenirs were even successful on an international fair in Germany.

I am very keen to learn Estonian because the more the business grows and the more contacts I have outside my hometown, the more communications there will be in Estonian. I'm active in the Town Council of Narva in solving the problems of disabled persons and I understand that it is much easier for me to manage in public service offices when I'm able to speak the state language. As I attend the IOM/OSCE Estonian language courses, I can teach my daughters at home to speak Estonian. We are Russians by nationality but we want to stay in Estonia, this is where our home is.

Tatjana Kulikova

Tatjana is 39, she comes from Siberia, Kemerovo region. She came to Estonia after marrying a marine officer who was sent to Paldiski nuclear submarine training centre as a lecturer. When the Soviet emporium fell apart and the Russian army was taken out of Estonia, her husband could not adjust himself to the new situation – he drank himself to the bottom. Tatjana was left alone with a 16-year-old daughter.

I had been used to living behind the back of my well-earning officer husband. When the life changed all of a sudden, I was very confused in the beginning. At first I found the way out with the help of a profession learned at school – I have a nurse's diploma. But according to Estonian legislation, doctors and nurses must know the state language. I could not afford to pay for language courses. I was happy when I could join the IOM/OSCE language school free of charge.

I've always been interested in cosmetology. I had even attended respective courses. When I was offered a possibility of starting my own business, I immediately thought of opening a beauty parlour. Women always want to be beautiful and a beautician should not have problems because of lack of clients. I found that the important starting point would be to have a room. I asked for a support to rebuild my flat so that I would have a secluded room to serve the clients. It worked.

Another thing I need to implement my business idea is Estonian language. There are quite many Estonians in Paldiski now. I have to be able to speak in the client's mother tongue. I keep learning Estonian on the courses arranged by the project and I'm very grateful for the opportunity. I myself teach massage to those who wish. They tell me I have good hands.

Interviews with the language camp participants and their hosts

Kersti Vesilind

Kersti is the language studies project manager on the island of Hiiumaa.

She has two small children (7-year-old Kaisa and 2-year-old Andrias) and is a homemaker at the moment.

In order to keep up with life, I took part in a training on writing projects. My trial project was about teaching Estonian in families. I could not imagine that I will actually need the project. I was proposed to prepare a language summer camp in Narva and Narva-Jõesuu for women studying Estonian on the language courses organised by IOM/OSCE.

The first task was to find the families in Hiiumaa who would agree to host language students, to accommodate, cater and deal with them for the purposes of teaching language.

I published an ad in the local newspaper. The offers piled in. I had the opportunity to choose. I visited homes, discussed the matter with the hostesses, told them about the conditions, etc. I think that the chosen families are suitable and truly interested not only in the support funds the project can pay but, first of all, they are attracted by the idea of taking part in this interesting project.

It is the first time I'm involved in such a project. In order to really understand how it works, I also accommodated a language student. So I can see what the language camp problems can be, what are the needs of the students and what are the expectations of both the students and the host families, for myself.

Since the first days, I have had the thoughts that such method of teaching and learning a language can also make a good business idea. My husband's parents have a farm in Hiiumaa. We could make the farm into a language study centre to operate not as a tourist farm but as a language centre where people would be able to practice their Estonian in the natural environment for moderate fees and also gain knowledge about Estonians' way of life, cultural background, etc.

So the project has given me a good idea for the future.

Tatjana Korotkevitch

Tatjana is a Belorussian from Narva, she happened to move to Estonia after the Chernobyl catastrophe. Her home was within the radiation zone. Tatjana left her Chernobyl catastrophe. Her home was within the radiation zone. Tatjana left her home and moved to Narva in order to save the children from radiation.

I had never been to Estonia. And Narva is not a real Estonia. All the life went on in Russian. I managed to meet some Estonians who had stayed in Narva. I was touched by their attitude towards the culture of their nation, their eagerness when they told me about that, their wish to be the patriots of their homeland. As soon as the opportunity came to start learning Estonian, I joined the courses. It was not easy. Refugees have no real home, no job, no connections, no bright perspective. Thanks to the IOM/OSCE project I could learn Estonian free of charge. I'm grateful for the opportunity. Grateful not only for the language classes. I'm also grateful because as I saw the work that is done in Estonia to make the newcomers realise where they live and what kind of people Estonians are, I started to think more and more about the destiny of my unhappy Belorussia. I'm a Belorussian, a member of a big and talented nation but I don't know the Belorussian language. Believe me or not but I started to study my mother tongue only here, in Estonia. We have a Belorussian society in Narva for our language and culture studies. At present I learn two languages at a time and I feel that my life is richer than ever before, never mind that it is very difficult to cope economically. Until I have not quite mastered Estonian, it is difficult to get a good job, the children need schooling, my relatives in Belorussia are relying on me for support. But everything will be fine.

Ljubov Nikker

Ljubov is a student of Estonian from Narva. She works in Narva Children Creativity House. She is an economist by profession – a graduate of Tallinn Technical University.

Ljubov is 42, she comes from Komi. Her parents were Ingrian Finnish or simply Ingrian.

Ingrians are a little Finno-Ugric nation whose territory over the history has been occupied by Swedish, Danish and then Russians. Before the Stalin repression my parents lived in Ingermanland that was then a part of the territory of the Leningrad region. In the thirties, the Stalin regime started to destroy systematically the small nations in Russia. My parents were deported to North – Ural in Komi Autonomous Republic as children. I was born in a village in Komi.

My grandmother who had escaped deportation by a miracle, had stayed alone in the Leningrad region. During the World War II, German occupation authorities repatriated from the occupied Leningrad region to Estonia. My grandmother ended up in north-eastern Estonia. She found her home in the small town of Narva-Jõesuu. When I came to visit my grandmother in Estonia for the first time after I finished school, I really liked Estonia from the very beginning. I went to study in Tallinn Technical University, graduated with an economist's diploma, found a job in Narva.

After Estonia became independent, I had a problem with citizenship. I had to know Estonian in order to become a citizen of the Republic of Estonia. In Komi I studied in a Russian school. There was no Secondary School in Komi to teach in Komi language. At home my parents spoke Finnish but I had not learned it. I did not need Estonian in the Russian-speaking Narva. More than 90 per cent of the population in Narva were the workers brought in from Russia. Administration and management was in Russian only.

Only after Estonia became an independent country, did I realise that I am like a plant with no roots. I had neither homeland nor mother tongue, nor love for my fatherland. Hundreds of thousands of people like me had lost their roots, their national identity, e traditions of their families and community. I had considered myself a Russian. When I started to study Estonian, I discovered the meaning of national language and national feelings. I also developed an interest towards the origin of my parents, their nationality and towards the culture of my ancestors. This way the learning of the language of the tiny Estonian nation broadened my world.

It is not easy for a grown-up to learn a language. I started several times and each time gave up. The first language summer camp in the island of Hiiu was a major breakthrough. I happened to live in the home of a very nice hostess. From the first moment on, Maire spoke only Estonian to me. And the miracle happened – unexpectedly, I started to speak Estonian!

Now I am spending the second summer in the same place in the language summer camp. I feel myself very much at home in the Estonian family home. I understand everything, discuss the issues of the world with the hostess, go shopping with the family, we spend the leisure time together, I help to do the housekeeping chores, talk to neighbours, make jam in the kitchen, water the flowers in the garden and row the boat.

I've lived in Estonia for 8 years but it is only through the language classes that I have learned to know the Estonians.

Maire Paljas

Maire is a hostess for language students in the island of Hiiu, in Kärdla. She was born, finished school and worked in Hiiumaa. She graduated from a Commercial School. The two years of teaching Estonian to Russian women within the framework of the summer school project has helped her to discover her teaching talent.

The story of our ancestors is a romantic one. Hiiumaa was at the crossing of big sailing routes. Near the island the were dangerous banks and many a time ships ran aground. Some of the sailors managed to swim to the shore. So there were sons of far-off countries who married local women and started families here. People of Hiiumaa often have brown eyes and dark skin which is not characteristic to the mainland Estonians. So maybe my temperament is really too emotional for an Estonian woman. Indeed, I'm a rather shy person. When I read the advertisement in the local paper that was looking for homes which can provide language practice for Russian women who study Estonian, I was hesitant of whether I should try. Eventually I decided and I am very pleased I did.

We hosted Ljubov from Narva who appeared to be very pleasant and eager to learn. We have become friends. I'm happy that her Estonian has improved so much but I and my family have learned very much from Ljubov. Now I know a great deal more about the life of Russians, their life, their culture, traditions and what's most important – I understand the problems of people who live among other nationality.

Interviews with the teachers of Estonian:

Vladimir Zubarev

Vladimir is a teacher of Estonian in a Russian school in Narva. He comes from a mixed family and knows both Estonian and Russian from childhood.

Actually, it is difficult to determine my nationality. My father was a Siberian Estonian. His family went to Russia during the Tsar government, before the big revolution in Russia. There were even Estonian villages in Siberia. Our family returned to Estonia in the twenties. I'm born and have finished school in Estonia. My mother is a Russian from Narva. I am fluent in both the languages since childhood. I studied Russian philology in Tartu University. My first job was in Valga where I taught Russian in an Estonian school. In Narva I started to teach Estonian to Russian children. Teaching the Estonian language to adults is not only my work but it has also become my hobby. I have used a lot of my own methodology to make the classes more interesting, to help the student remember the language better and to raise interest toward learning the language.

I am the project manager of the IOM/OSCE project in Narva (3 groups) and Narva-Jõesuu (2 groups). Language classes for women who cannot pay for the classes themselves are extremely needed. After there was an ad in the newspaper about the project, there were 500 applications. The most important aspect in the project is the possibility to organise language summer camps. In the camps the women learn the living language of communication and can establish immediate contacts with Estonians.

Moonika Laht

Moonika's main job is in the Russian Gymnasium of Narva. Moonika was born in Tartu. After she married a man from St. Petersburg, they moved to Narva. For years, she has been teaching Estonian to adults.

In fact, Estonians are a minority in Narva and elsewhere in the Eastern Virumaa and Estonian is the language of the minority. People who wish to study the state language, actually study a language that they do not hear every day and that they have had no use for until now. Now the situation has changed. The local Russians understand perfectly well that they need to know the Estonian language in the independent republic of Estonia but it is very complicated to learn a language as an adult without the possibility to use it. I have always thought of possibilities to give the students a chance to practice the knowledge acquired in classes. The current project has found the opportunity. It is the language summer camp: a wonderful chance to polish language skills and enjoy it.

I chose the island of Hiiumaa for the language camp because Estonian is spoken everywhere on the small island. The local people know that there are Russian women from Ida-Virumaa who want to learn Estonian. Their attempts are supported and they are treated with warmth. Integration really works and it is not a political activity but a real and natural situation that brings people together. At the beginning a Russian woman whose knowledge of Estonian is weak may be worried and troubled about how she will manage in the language camp. But by the time the camp finishes, they have found so many friends and have adjusted so well that everybody is sad to part.

Marge Mägi

She is an Estonian linguist from the north-eastern Estonia, she raises a son on her own and therefore understands the problems of her students very well.

Our group was made up of women who raise children alone, are unemployed or earn low wages. Free language studies is the only possibility for them to learn Estonian. They can not pay for classes

and the exam also costs 50 kroons. In the given project everything is free of charge for the participants.

Besides the language classes it is very important for them to have a chance to communicate, to take part in seminars that deal with issues of interest to women. The most difficult thing in teaching the Estonian language for Russian women is to overcome the fear. Usually people come convinced that Estonian is very difficult, that there is no way it can be mastered, that they cannot do it, etc. Once the fear is overcome and students have the courage to talk, the training will also give results. In classes I use the training aids and materials that I have collected during the years I have been teaching. Twelve years of practical experience in teaching Estonian to foreigners gives you a lot. The women try hard and are conscientious. Besides, for many of them, the language classes are the only possibility to communicate with people, get out of home and participate in the community life.

The exam that has to be passed in order to get the certificate, is quite difficult and demanding. I am as just nervous before the tests as my students are. On the day of the test I'm always there, even though the regulations do not allow the teacher to enter the examination room.

I think that the women who have problems with social adaptation should continue language studies until they achieve at least the so-called medium level of language proficiency. Otherwise they forget what they learned during the project and the training will not result in the intended outcome.