

EVALUATION BRIEF

EXTERNAL EX-POST EVALUATION OF: PROMOTING INTEGRITY IN INTERNATIONAL RECRUITMENT AND MIGRANT SKILL DEVELOPMENT IN JAMAICA

This learning brief is a summary of the key findings, conclusions, and recommendations prepared by the Owl RE consultancy for use by IOM project staff and management and the Fund. Details on all of the findings, conclusions, and recommendations can be found in the full evaluation report.

Evaluation type: External independent ex-post evaluation

Evaluator(s): Patricia Goldschmid, Owl RE

Final report: 19 March 2022

Commissioned by: IOM Development Fund ("The Fund") and IOM Jamaica

Managed by: Keisha Livermore, IOM Jamaica

Evaluation purpose: To assess the relevance of the project for the stakeholders and beneficiaries, to determine whether the project has achieved its intended objective; the effectiveness and efficiency of project management and implementation; promote transparency and accountability, assist the Fund in its decision-making, better equip staff to make judgments about the project and to improve the effectiveness for potential future project funding.

Evaluation criteria: Relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability.

Evaluation methodology: Document review and semi-structured interviews.

PROJECT SUMMARY

Large sections of the Caribbean population seek employment opportunities in Canada and USA, and increasingly also, within the region. While providing valuable and needed labour support, countries of origin sometimes struggle to apply regulations to guide international recruitment practices, with the result that private employment agencies and other contractors or sub-contractors frequently operate without registration and control.

This project was implemented in partnership with the Government of Jamaica (GOJ). Its objective was to contribute to the protection of Jamaican migrant workers and promote the development and circulation of their skills through the fostering of multi-stakeholder partnerships among key labour migration stakeholders in Jamaica.

Project information:

Geographical coverage: Jamaica

Project type: Labour Migration

Project code: LM.0333

Project period: 1 December 2017 – 31 December 2020

Budget: USD 100,000



Three reports produced by the project: *Promoting Integrity in International Recruitment and Migrant Skill Development in Jamaica*

KEY FINDINGS

The project was successful in reaching its objective to contribute to the protection of Jamaican migrant workers by promoting ethical recruitment in key labour migration corridors from Jamaica, particularly to Canada and the USA. It was well aligned with national priorities and strategies. It incurred a number of challenges which led to delays; however, it was able to deliver the outputs that were confirmed of value to the Government of Jamaica (GOJ).

Relevance, (rating: Excellent – 5): The project was aligned with national priorities and strategies, as well as government policies. It was developed following an initiative by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MLSS) to review Jamaica’s primary legislation used to monitor employment which had not been revised since its enactment in 1957.

Coherence, (rating: Good – 3): The project built on the links established through a previous project supported by the Fund in 2011, which supported the establishment of a sustainable multi-stakeholders’ coordination process. It was also complementary to IOM’s Global Mainstreaming Migration (MM) into National Development Strategies Project, developed between 2011 and 2018.

Effectiveness, (rating: Good – 3): The project was mostly successful in achieving its objective. While the Pre-Departure Orientation (PDO) curriculum was revised, the legislation was still in the process of being reviewed at the time of this evaluation. Positive factors included the government’s willingness to participate in the project, the momentum created through previous projects, a positive collaboration with some consultancies, while negative factors included some challenges in communication with and receiving information from government, changes in staff at both MLSS and IOM, limitations in financial and human resources, Internet connectivity issues and internal Information Technology (IT) problems.

Efficiency, and Cost-Effectiveness (rating: Adequate – 2): Overall, the project management was noted as exerting a high level of professionalism and positive relationships, which has been recognized by all the stakeholders interviewed and evoked in the Project Performance Review (PPR). The project incurred several delays largely linked to challenges with the government response, as well as the COVID-19 pandemic, which started towards the end of the project.

Impact, (rating: Adequate - 2): The most important contribution was that the outputs generated raised awareness about ethical labour migration both within Jamaica, as well as the Caribbean region and the receiving countries Canada and the USA.

Sustainability, (rating: Adequate – 2): The fact that the project was based on a specific request from the government was thought to be a positive basis for its long-term sustainability as well as and that the project results were based on a baseline assessment. Nevertheless, the project was missing an official handover as well as institutionalized buy-in from the government for the implementation of the results.

Conclusions

The project was able to achieve its objective through the publication of three publications and the organization of several workshops to allow the GOJ and other stakeholders including the broader Caribbean region to enhance knowledge and access tools to improve ethical recruitment standards and practices in labour migration. The project incurred challenges such as delays in the collaboration with the GOJ, as well as the COVID-19 pandemic, which emerged towards the end of the project and meant that approaches needed to be adjusted.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS (for IOM Jamaica:)

A. Project design

- For similar future projects of this nature, include government stakeholders early in the project development phase to ensure buy-in and establish clear tasks and guidelines.
- Support stakeholders in defining and securing resource allocation for the continuation of the project.
- Ensure that processes are institutionalized by integrating them into a strategy with a clear plan of action and a timeline that delineates steps for the government after the project end.

B. Project management

For future similar projects, require monitoring reports from stakeholders to ensure that timelines are respected and maintained. Maintain a close working relationship with the government counterpart and ensure that a monitoring mechanism is established with regular updates.

C. Sustainability

- For future similar projects, ensure that an official handover is conducted and secure a commitment to a post-project plan of action and an implementation strategy.
- To ensure the benefits of this project continue, IOM Jamaica should consider developing new project(s) to support the government in the implementation of recommendations from the project’s three reports in the field of labour migration and ethical recruitment.

D. Beneficiaries

Ensure that enough focus is placed on affected populations in the design and assessment processes to allow for strategies to best reach migrants, mitigate obstacles, and allow for a representative sample to be integrated into the